

PAPER NAME

Tracking the factors causing harmonious
Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali (1).pdf

AUTHOR

I Ketut Wisarja Fakultas Brahma Widya

WORD COUNT

8970 Words

CHARACTER COUNT

49121 Characters

PAGE COUNT

14 Pages

FILE SIZE

670.1KB

SUBMISSION DATE

Oct 1, 2023 7:21 AM GMT+8

REPORT DATE

Oct 1, 2023 7:21 AM GMT+8

● **12% Overall Similarity**

The combined total of all matches, including overlapping sources, for each database.

- Crossref Posted Content database
- 12% Submitted Works database

● **Excluded from Similarity Report**

- Internet database
- Publications database
- Crossref database
- Manually excluded sources

ISSN: (Print) (Online) Journal homepage: <https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/oass20>

Tracking the factors causing harmonious Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali

23
Ketut Wisarja & I Ketut Sudarsana

To cite this article: Ketut Wisarja & I Ketut Sudarsana (2023) Tracking the factors causing harmonious Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali, Cogent Social Sciences, 9:2, 2259470, DOI: [10.1080/23311886.2023.2259470](https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2023.2259470)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2023.2259470>




© 2023 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group.




Published online: 18 Sep 2023.



[Submit your article to this journal](#) 



[View related articles](#) 



[View Crossmark data](#) 



Received: 06 July 2023
Accepted: 12 September 2023

*Corresponding author: I Ketut Wisarja, Department of Hindu Philosophy, Universitas Hindu Negeri I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar, Jalan Ratna No. 51 Denpasar, Bali 80239, Indonesia
E-mail: wisarjaketut@gmail.com

Reviewing editor:
Guangchao Charles Feng, School of Communication, Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong

Additional information is available at the end of the article

MEDIA & COMMUNICATION STUDIES | RESEARCH ARTICLE

Tracking the factors causing harmonious Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali

I Ketut Wisarja^{1*} and I Ketut Sudarsana¹

Abstract: Hindu-Islamic relations have long existed in Bali. This is due to the relationship between the kings in Bali who are Hindus and the kings outside Bali who are Muslim. In various activities such as marriage, trade and others, between the two Kingdoms mutually made agreements. Like for example the king of Badung or Karangasem who married a princess from a kingdom outside Bali. On her way, the princess who was asked to take along her maids and some soldiers with her. The king then gave them a place to live. They then settled in Bali and have grown to this day. Several areas of land were also given to them like in Buitan Village, Manggis, and others where they still exist and have developed to this day. Since their arrival, they have interacted directly with local residents. They help each other and contribute to each other so that a good relationship is established between them. When Hindus carry out activities, they help, and vice versa. This article aims to discuss and analyze the factors that caused the relationship and history of Hindu-Islamic harmony in Bali to be well and harmoniously maintained until now.

Subjects: Culture & Development; Religion; Cultural Studies

Keywords: hindu; islam; relationship; bali; cultural

1. Introduction

Symptoms of violence (violence), barbarity (barbarity), cruelty (cruelty), and all forms of action that exceed the limits of humanity (inhumanity) that appear in human life are essentially old, as old as the history of humanity itself. Likewise, the symptoms of a life that are oriented to the foundation of humanity (humanity), peace (peace), security (security), tolerance, benevolence (benevolence), and a sense of love between human beings, It is also old, as old as human history in knowing the culture, civilization, and religion. Culturally, the first symptom is seen as one of the characteristics of wild human life or those still living at the level of barbarism. While the second is seen as a general characteristic that applies in civilized human life, namely those familiar with a high level of culture and civilization (Wirata, 2023).

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

I Ketut Wisarja is a lecturer at Universitas Hindu Negeri I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar, often conducting research related to tolerance and religious harmony in Indonesia.

I Ketut Sudarsana is a lecturer at Universitas Hindu Negeri I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar, whose research focus is Hindu religious education, but since 3 years ago he has also been interested in research related to religious moderation.

In the historical process, the two symptoms often appear together or overlap. Signs of violence are often inherent in the process of change, mainly if carried out by revolution, while symptoms of peace are inherent (though not always) in change through evolution. The struggle between the paths of process and development is reflected in the battle between war and peace, namely the struggle to create a world free from violence. The struggle between war and peace occupies a long historical journey from a simple society (primitive) to modern society.

The long history of violence indicates how society is never sterile or free from such behavior under any circumstances. Violence is the most prominent sight in the history of humanity. This phenomenon seems to indicate an existential problem in every development of society, including in the process of interrelation between religious believers. Relations between religious believers in a social system or society logically justify Sartre's thesis Bertens (1999) that "hell is someone else".

Sartre once said in one of his plays *Closed Doors*, that "Hell is someone else," or "My original sin is the existence of other people" in his book *Being and Nothingness*, but then he realized that he wanted a bond and he found someone else as a condition. For its existence. To obtain the truth about himself, everyone must need other people too. By starting from this general situation humans try to make possible and plan a human life.

Sartre then tries to create a new human moral code in this context. Because everyone is bound to other people, his freedom as a human must also take into account the space of others. Man cannot create freedom without simultaneously doing the same thing with the release of others. However, the essence of every relationship between human beings turns out to be a conflict; because other people make me—says Sartre – (Van der, 2000) into an object or "I" make the same thing to other people. What happens next is alienation or alienation. Humans will only be closer to one another if they join forces against a third person because an objective "we" will emerge. War, famine, and class oppression usually make up that "us." Only as long as pressure lasts, people who oppress and oppress form our unity; after that, harmony will be lost again (Adhitama, 2023; Van der, 2000).

Perhaps a very radical concept; "I" and "you" are a conflict, because "I" will always be the subject of you (objecting) others, born of a bitter experience when Sartre saw the atrocities of World War II, which was quite devastating. Human values, if it is believed to be accurate. The painful experience formed a belief that there was never objective love in any relationship, that there was nothing but selfishness; I, as the subject, will always try to control you as the object. That is why every relationship between humans can be derived from conflict. Conflict is at the heart of every intersubjective relationship. This opinion is related to the notion of consciousness, namely the activity of consciousness to "action," which always takes place in every encounter between consciousnesses.

Thus, the relationship between religious believers is a human relationship. Therefore, serious efforts are needed from all parties to turn this relationship into something dynamic. For this reason, it is necessary to strive for a religious or theological way that can appreciate this. Humanist theology becomes interesting as the basis for an intimate meeting point of religions.

Implementing a humanist religion at the practical level is a critical discourse or needs to be understood in Bali. There are many religious groups in Bali. Each group has its characteristics influenced by the religions it adheres to. These religious-based communities have a vital role in maintaining Bali harmony. A deep appreciation of the practice of humanist religion is very significant. These communities are later expected to convey these values to the broader community (Wisarja, 2017). So that inter-religious conflicts (especially Hindu-Islamic) in Bali rarely happen, as we are witnessing today, that Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali have been harmoniously intertwined for centuries. When Bali was still a kingdom since time immemorial, the Hindu-Islamic relationship was never a significant conflictual problem that could strain the relationship. Although

there are small ripples, these can be overcome by religious leaders in Bali and resolved by deliberation/consensus and mutual understanding between those in conflict. In 2002 and 2004, Bali was the target of violence, namely the Bali Bombings I and Bali Bombing II, which destroyed the Padis Club and the Sari Club by irresponsible people, to create a chaotic and conflictual situation between religious believers instead of provoking inter-religious conflict in Bali, it was welcomed by further strengthening the bonds of unity and brotherhood among religious believers. The proof is that all religious leaders in Bali were mobilizing their people to help the Bali Bombings I and Bali Bombing II, victims.

2. Methods

This study uses a qualitative research method, which emphasizes the process and meaning studied as a whole, statically and concretely based on social philosophy. In the natural conditions of the emergence of various paradigm changes in social life, the reality of phenomena in the community can be classified; the fact is fixed, concrete, observable, measurable, and a causal relationship of symptoms is carried out. Change is seen as naturalistic in this paradigm because the research is carried out in natural, holistic, complex, dynamic, and meaningful conditions, often called the positivism paradigm, which develops qualitative research types.

The instruments used are various data collection tools, such as interview guides, observation guidelines, recording devices, etc. The data collection methods used in this study include; observation, interview, documentation, and literature study. The things that were observed were the places where the Muslim community in Bali resided which were the settlements given by the Kings of Bali. The informants who were interviewed were those who understood their existence well, such as the royal family and community leaders there. The documentation studied is several historical records relating to the existence of Muslim people who were brought to Bali. Furthermore, the data obtained were analyzed with steps such as; (1) Data reduction, (2) Data classification, (3) Data interpretation, and (4) Concluding.

3. Result and discussion

3.1. Tracking harmonious Hindu-Islamic relationships in Bali

The relationship between religious people in Bali with the culture of “*menyama braya*” has been proven to bring the lives of religious people to be more harmonious. Because Hindus in Bali consider that “all human beings are brothers” (*menyama braya*), then the Balinese Hindus refer to their brothers of different religions as; “*Nyama Selam*,” a term for Balinese who are Muslim, “*Nyama Christian*,” a time for Balinese who are Christian, and “*Nyama Cina*,” a period for Balinese people who are ethnic Chinese; whether Buddhist or Confucian and so on.

Bertens (2002) mentions that several factors strengthen harmonious relations between religious communities in Bali: (1) All religions teach compassion, tolerance, and mutual respect for fellow human beings. There is not a single sacred scripture that teaches evil, hates, attacks, or hurts other religious people; (2) Balinese, regardless of their religion, in the life of the nation and state have acknowledged “*Bhineka Tunggal Ika*” as the unifier of the Indonesian government, are ready physically and mentally to accept differences, whether ethnic, religious, and racial; (3) The 1945 Constitution, article 29, paragraphs 1 and 2, reads “The State is based on the One Godhead” and “The State guarantees the independence of every resident to embrace their respective religions and to worship according to their religion and beliefs.”; (4) The nature of the Indonesian people, especially the Balinese regardless of their religion, is very tolerant, easy to get along with, friendly and polite; (5) The Balinese population, who are mostly Hindus with a solid cultural system, very tolerant and ready to accept anyone as a brother, have become role models for other non-Hindu Balinese; (6) The power structure (read government) which is objective, fair, honest and clean in serving and treating its citizens causes harmonious relations between religious believers; (7) The concept of religious harmony at the national level also has an impact on harmony in other areas in Indonesia, including Bali; and (8) For Balinese (Hindu) religious differences are not a problem,

because the difference is a gift from God, the difference is the law of nature itself, the difference is truth and truth is God himself (Gandhi, 1996).

Living in peace, harmony, and tolerance among religious people is everyone's dream (Sudarsana et al., 2023). Therefore, the above factors are decisive and must be obeyed by all citizens to maintain harmonious relations between religious believers. Denial of the rules that have been agreed upon will only trigger conflicts between religions, and it will be challenging to find a solution.

3.1.1. Harmony according to Hinduism

According to the Hindu view, "Religious harmony" means that followers of different religions are consciously willing to live in harmony and peace. Living in harmony and peace is based on tolerance, mutual understanding, mutual respect, mutual respect, inequality, and cooperation in social life in society. Living in harmony means living together in a peaceful community, respecting each other, and working together/cooperating. Atharvaveda, VII.52.1, describes, "May we have the same harmony with those we know well, May we have the same harmony with strangers, May You bless us with harmony (harmony/harmony)." Furthermore, Atharvaveda, XII.I.45, describes, "Everyone speaks different languages, and embraces different religions (beliefs) So that the motherland is like a family carrying a burden. May he bestow prosperity upon us and cultivate respect among us, like a female cow to her cubs." The two Atharvaveda passages prove that Hinduism teaches all human beings to act and act in a good and right way and be humane. Hinduism teaches all its people to uphold human values such as; honesty, love, do not hurt, do not lie, and so on. All of these concepts emphasize respect for human values.

The idea is contained in several teachings, such as; the instructions of "Tri Hita Karana," "Tri Kaya Parisudha," "Catur Paramita," "Tat Twam Asi," and even Mahatma Gandhi, a humanitarian fighter from India who is also a staunch Hindu believer, said, "All Humans are Brothers" (*Wasudeva Kutumbhakam*). If this teaching is applied in daily life, harmony in human relations will be adequately achieved. Gorda (1996), "Tri Hita Karana," comes from Sanskrit, "Tri" means three, "Hita" means welfare or happiness, and "Karana" means cause. Thus *Tri Hita Karana* means three reasons of well-being or happiness, namely; (1) *Parahyangan*, namely fostering a harmonious relationship between humans and *Ida Sang Hyang Widhi Wasa* or God Almighty; (2) *Pawongan*, namely fostering harmonious relations between fellow human beings without distinction of origin, race, ethnicity, religion, nationality and so on; and (3) *Palemahan*, namely fostering harmonious relationship between humans and their natural environment. These three harmonious relationships can bring happiness, peace, harmony to human life on this Earth. Furthermore, Nurasa (2007) describes "Tri Kaya Parisudha," which means three behaviors that must be purified, namely; (1) *Manacika Parisudha*, which means purifying the mind, among others; always think positively towards others, think calmly (*manahprasadah*), gentle (*saumyatwam*), quiet (*maunam*), self-control (*atmawinigraha*), pure soul/upright heart (*bhawasamsuddir*); (2) *Wacika Parisudha*, means to purify speech, among others; speak gently, say things that do not hurt the heart/do not offend others/do not make others angry (*anudwegakaram wakyam*), speak the truth (*satyam wakyam/satya* discourse), speak pleasantly (*priya Hitam wakyam*), trustworthy and helpful; and (3) *Kayika Parisudha*, which is to purify actions, among others; behave politely, respect saints/priests, respect teachers, respect wise people, behave holy (*arjawa*), and do not hurt/kill other creatures (*ahimsa*).

The teachings of *Tri Kaya Parisudha* require a person to always think positively towards others, speak gentle and pleasant words to others, and avoid behavior that makes others unhappy. That is, carrying out *Tri Kaya Parisudha* means avoiding/eliminating the lack of respect for the dignity of other human beings, which can lead to prolonged anger and resentment among fellow human beings.

Religion that emphasizes belief must be in line with the sides of humanity. Ratu Bagus (Wisarja, 2017201) describes that only when a person can behave humanely can he be called a religious person. Religion and humanity are a unified whole. There will never be religion without being accompanied by the principles of humanity, as well as human values will dry up without being based on religion. Therefore, the Ratu Bagus Ashram emphasizes the importance of worship in the form of humanitarian service. Prayerfully praying before God is a good thing, but if it is accompanied by rude and anarchic thoughts and behavior towards fellow human beings, it will destroy the quality of the prayer. Feelings and solemn ideas in performing prayers must be followed by emotions and a deep conscience towards humanity.

In addition to the teachings of *Tri Kaya Parisudha* mentioned above, Hinduism teaches harmony in the association between fellow human beings based on love for fellow human beings. Associations/relationships between human beings (read; inter-religious relations) require individual sacrifice because living in society is personal self-sacrifice to society. According to Ardhana et al. (2011), outlining the basis of “love” to fellow human beings is called “*Catur Paramita*.” *Catur Paramita* means; four foundations of etiquette in the association of living together in society, namely; (1) *Maitri*, which means love for fellow creatures, especially for fellow human beings; (2) *Karuna*, meaning mutual help among human beings, so that there is peace in all endeavors in society, harmonious and peaceful; (3) *Upeksha*, meaning the desire to achieve harmony without looking at differences in ethnicity, religion, race, and human nature; and (4) *Mudita*, meaning mutual sympathy and empathy among human beings that arise from mutual love, mutual assistance, and mutual honing, compassion, and care.

Mahatma Gandhi (Astuti Dewi, 2012), describes “I don’t want every side of my house to be covered by walls with locked windows and doors. I want the culture and art of all lands to blow into my house as freely as possible. What I have is not a religion that is like a prison. I value individual freedom but don’t forget that humans are social creatures. Man has achieved his present dignity by adapting his individualistic nature to social progress demands.

Signs of a person’s success in religion can be seen when he can show the quality of his life in responding to and treating various faiths’ goodness. God is intrinsically perfect and does not need to be “defended” desperately by humanity. Hence, the following human task is always to share and care for fellow humans and the surrounding environment. Such life practices need to be put forward to maintain harmonious relations. In the context of social life, which is currently in a chaotic condition and the presence of several violent practices everywhere in the name of religion, the method of serving others and prioritizing the values of *ahimsa* (non-violence), *Satya* (truth), and *karuna* (compassion) as practiced by Mahatma Gandhi, of course, deserves to be put forward. Such life practice follows the spirit of respect for plurality and human values.

Religion was revealed on this Earth to humanize humans so that human life would be better. There are no religious teachings that blaspheme humans with their humanity. It’s just a misunderstanding of religious education that makes society lose its meaning because religion seems to have no interest in respecting human dignity.

According to Mudiarcana in his paper entitled “Religious Harmony and Tolerance in Hinduism,” describes “*Tat Twam Asi*” in an articulation meaning “I am you, you are me.” This means that everyday human interactions should always be guided by the philosophy of “*tat twam asi*.” Hence, it is not easy to carry out actions that can offend and even hurt the hearts of others, which in turn causes envy, hatred, and anger. By assuming that other people are ourselves, we treat others the way we would like others to treat us. *Tat twam asi* leads to “*Tepa Selira*” or tolerance which guides humans in thinking, speaking, and behaving correctly and correctly, so that they do not think negatively of others, do not say words that can offend others, and do not behavior that can harm others.

Building beautiful harmony in a pluralist society as beautiful as a flower garden overgrown with various colors must be the dreams of all citizens driven by religious leaders. In this context, all religions are believed by their followers to be a path to goodness. Still, their adherents cannot be separated from all interests that contradict the central message of their religion so that they can change the face of religious adherents from being humanist to something scary, especially about inter-religious relations.

Religion (whatever its name), by its adherents, is believed to be a sacred guide that comes from God so that humans act correctly according to His instructions. If religion is a holy guide for humans to work correctly, religion should be very functional in building harmony between religious humans. However, the reality shows that various violence in the name of religion has recently been quite rampant in multiple parts of the country where the people “claim” to uphold their religious values.

The religious face of today’s positivistic society must prioritize human values, tolerance, mutual respect and be based on scientific thinking. Religion is no longer just talking about things that are beyond human reasoning. Religion must run based on the problems faced by humans themselves. Bhagavadgita, IV.11 describes, “Whatever path people take, towards me all of them, I receive them from everywhere, Thus, O Partha” (Eka, 2023). Furthermore, Atharvaveda XII.1.45 explains; “Give appreciation to your people who use various regional languages, who adhere to different beliefs/religions, appreciate those who live together on this mother earth, Earth that provides balance like a cow that gives milk to humans, thus the motherland provides abundant happiness for the people. Looking at the description above, it is necessary to have genuine efforts that can be made in fostering inter-religious harmony, such as interfaith dialogue, interfaith studies, holding cultural festivals, holding interfaith youth camps, increasing a sense of brotherhood and love the homeland, performing humanitarian services, and religious education that emphasizes universal human values.

In the Atharvaveda, III.30.4, it is described as “O humanity! Unite, and be reconciled as the union of the gods, I have given the same thing to you, therefore create unity among you, says God in the Atharvaveda. Furthermore, in the Rigveda, X.191.2, it is described as “O humanity, live in harmony and concord, Be united and work together, Speak one language, And make decisions with one mind, Like the saints of the past who have carried out their duties, You should not waver in carrying out your duties.” Implementing a humanist religion at the practical level is a critical discourse in Bali. There are many religious groups in Bali. Each group has its characteristics influenced by the beliefs it adheres to. These religious-based communities have a vital role in efforts to maintain social harmony. A deep appreciation of the practice of humanist religion is very significant. These communities are expected to convey these values to the broader community.

Indeed, every religious teaching (whatever its name) emphasizes the importance of fostering harmony, peace between fellow adherents of the religion concerned, and balance and harmony between followers of different faiths, especially Hindu-Islam relations in Bali, to maintain the harmonization of links that have been established since centuries are well entwined.

3.1.2. *Harmony according to Islam.* “*Ukhuwah Islamiyah*” is the concept of religious harmony according to Islam. *Ukhuwah Islamiyah* comes from the primary word “*Akhu*,” which means brother, friend, friend. The word “*Ukhuwah*” is an invented word that has the meaning or becomes an abstract noun of brotherhood, friendship, and association. At the same time, “*Islamiyah*” comes from the word Islam, which becomes or gives the character of *Ukhuwah*. If combined between the words *Ukhuwah* and *Islamiyah*, it will mean Islamic brotherhood or association according to Islam. It can be said that the notion of *Ukhuwah Islamiyah* is a description of the relationship between Muslims as a brotherhood, where one another seems to be in a bond. A hadith says that the relationship between Muslims is like one body; if one limb hurts, the whole body will feel the pain. It is also said that Muslims are like a building that supports each other. The implementation of

Ukhuwah Islamiyah becomes actual if it is related to the problem of social solidarity. *Ukhuwah Islamiyah* is a “*masyru*,” meaning ordered by religion. The words of unity, unity, and solidarity will have a higher weight when referred to as *Ukhuwah*. If the word *Ukhuwah* is combined with the word *Islamiyah*, it will describe one basic form, namely Islamic brotherhood, which is an objective potential.

Ismail Yahya stated that Islam means peace, security, comfort, and protection on IAIN Surakarta website. While religiously, Islam is a manifestation of peace. Hadith narrated by Bukhari, Rasulullah SAW said, “a Muslim is a person who other Muslims feel safe from (evil) tongue and hands.” Islam is a religion of “*rahmatan lil alamin*” consisting of two words, namely “*Rahmat*,” which means love, and “*Lil Alamin*,” which means all nature. However, scholars of interpretation differ on the meaning of *rahmatan lil alamin* in *Al Anbiya*. According to At-Tabari, the truest is (grace) for the believer, so Allah guides him and admits him to heaven by doing the deeds that Allah has commanded. Meanwhile, Islam ¹³ *rahmatan lil alamin* is an abstract concept that develops ¹⁸ naturalist, humanist, dialogical, and tolerant patterns of human relations. In addition, this concept ¹⁸ develops the use and management of nature with compassion. Simply put, Islam “*rahmatan lil alamin*” is Islam as a mercy for the entire universe. At first glance, it can be observed that Islam that is developing in Bali, especially in Manggis Village, Karangasem-Bali, is moderate Islam. It means; he always avoids extreme behavior, tends towards a middle ground or balance, his views are willing to consider the opinions of others who are different from them (inclusive), contextual and adaptive to the situation. Such behavior and thoughts are somewhat different from the behavior of Muslims elsewhere in Indonesia, such as; extreme, drastic, excessive, out of bounds, beyond natural, blind fanaticism, outrageous, radical, reactionary, revolutionary, ultra-conservative (exclusive), fundamentalist, puritanic and textualist (extreme right), and neither secular, liberal, individualism (extreme left).

In the book “Religious Moderation,” the word “moderate” or “*Wasathiyyah*” is one of the central teachings of Islam, which is often forgotten lately. This concept is closely related to all the problems in Islam regarding perspectives, beliefs, and actions of individuals, communities, and society. Citizens who have a moderate attitude will encourage the creation of harmony in individual behavior and community views, which in turn creates harmonious relationships between individuals in unity and avoids divisions and differences. However, this concept is often ignored even though its benefits and importance are visible in life (Kementerian Agama, 2019). *Wasathiyyah* originates from the word *was at*, which means “fair, the middle way, elected”. *Wasathiyyah* can also have the meaning of “strong” as in youth which is a strong position between the weaknesses of childhood and old age. The concept of *Wasathiyyah* is not only aimed at individuals but also groups or communities. In this case, it can be interpreted that the moderate attitude of the individual will encourage the formation of a moderate group or society. In the Qur’an, QS. Al-Baqarah: 143, mentioned:

...حيو سانلا يلع ءادهش اونوكتل اطسو تما مكانلعج كلذكو ادبهبش مكيلع لوسرلا ²⁵

“And that is what we have made you (Muslims) a *ummatan wasatha* so that you are witnesses of (deeds) humans and that the Apostle (Muhammad) is a witness for your actions...”. (QS. Al-Baqarah: 143 in ⁷ The Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia, 2019)

Imam Jalaluddin as Suyuthi interprets the word “*ummatan wasatha*” as the chosen people and the mediation community. At the same time, in his interpretation, Imam At-Tabari gives the meaning of a just and determined people. And the extreme left. “*ummatan wasatha*” in this verse also contains the understanding that Muslims live side by side with followers of other religions and beliefs in justice, humility, and harmony. Qaraḍāwī (2010) further explains that the *Vasantha ummah* is a society that is balanced between “science and charity, worship and social interaction, culture and character, truth and power, and political participation and involvement.” This kind of *ummah* will reject all forms of extremism and religious ignorance.

The concept of *ummatan wasatha* is limited to the individual's perspective and character of actions or events directly related to the individual. Moderate attitude is also related to how individuals respond and take action on what is happening around them and is not by the practical philosophy itself. Davids and Waghid (2016) argue that the *Vasantha ummatan* is a community that is always dynamic in providing independent critical judgments by formulating and delivering responses to contemporary issues so that the opinions expressed strengthen unity, integration, and a sense of belonging and avoid expressions that cause conflict. And divide. For this reason, moderation is also a response to any actions that tend to be extreme or neglect religion, injustice and disrupt the stability of society.

The meaning of *Wasathiyyah* was further formulated at the High-Level Consultation of World Muslim Scholars on *Wasathiyyah* in Bogor in May 2018. At this meeting, the scholars expanded the meaning of *Wasathiyyah* not only as a middle ground. They formulated seven main principles or values of *Wasathiyyah*, namely: *Tawassut* (a middle way that is not extreme left and right), *I'tidal* (fair), *Tasammuh* (tolerance), *Shura* (consultation), *islah* (involved in reformative and constructive actions), *Qudwatiyyah* (giving birth to noble initiatives and leading for human welfare), and *Wataniya was muwathanah* (respect for the nation-state and respect for citizenship) (Kementerian Agama, 2019). Meanwhile, in the view of NU figures, KH. Saifuddin Muhajir, Islam *wasathiyah*, contextualizing Islam amid global civilization. In other languages, Islam *wasathiyah* is the actualization or embodiment of Islam '*Rahman Lil Alamin* (Surah [21]: 107). KH. Afifuddin Muhajir explained that in star's law (Islamic law), the nature of *wasathiyah* and balance is seen in various issues such as (a) the balance between divinity (*ilahiyah*) and humanity (*insaniyah*), (b) the balance between texts and *ijtihad* (reason), (c) a balance between *nushush* (the texts of the Qur'an and Hadith) and *maqashid* (the goal of establishing the Shari'a), (d) a balance between firmness and flexibility, e) a balance between idealism and realism. The necessity to consider *maqashid* causes the development of Islamic law dynamic and contextual. This has the consequence of the birth of secondary postulates in Islam such as *qiyash*, *maslahah*, *istishlah*, and 'urf. Sometimes, these secondary postulates become separate operational arguments (Muhajir, 2018). Furthermore, Wahyudi (2011) quotes from Abou Fadl that religious moderation is a religion suitable for every place and time, is dynamic, and respects the traditions of the past while being actualized in the present context.

This opinion strengthens Kamali (2015), who argues that moderation will have no meaning unless applied and actualized in a context. The *wasathiyah* principles mentioned above are integrated into the paradigm of thinking and acting for everyone in every aspect of life. The focus of *tawassut* in understanding and carrying out religious teachings makes a Muslim, for example, understand the text of the Qur'an by using references from various Tafsir written by competent scholars and confirming the understanding obtained to religious leaders who are experts in the interpretation of the Qur'an. He does not understand the content and content of the Qur'an only based on a translation that is very likely to reduce the range of meaning stored in the text, and he does not give an interpretation to the text according to his own will and interests. This principle will also encourage individuals to accommodate the interests of several different groups to reach a better agreement.

Based on the above definition, it is clear that there are differences in moderate attitudes among Muslims worldwide. To identify a reasonable perspective and attitude, Yusuf al-Qardhawi, a middle Brotherhood figure, revealed the signs of moderation, including (1) a comprehensive understanding of Islam, (2) balance between shari'ah provisions and changing times, (3) support for peace and respect for human values, (4) recognition of religious, cultural and political plurality, and (5) recognition of minority rights. Meanwhile, Abdillah, (2015) provides a minimum standard of religious moderation. Acknowledging the existence of other parties, having a tolerant attitude, respect for differences of opinion, and not forcing one's will be using violence.

3.2. Factors causing harmonious Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali

The island of Bali is famous throughout the world for its natural beauty and richness and the hospitality of its people how. People's attention to the island of Bali can be seen by the visits of thousands of people every year, both from within and outside the country. The island of Bali is also the island with the largest population of Hindus in Indonesia, so the variety of cultures that emerge are in the form of their uniqueness and distinctiveness, which grows from the spirit of Hinduism, which cannot be separated from ceremonies, arts, and organizations in Balinese human life which have social characteristics. Religious. Balinese culture is a combination of customs and Hindu religious values.

Balinese people have specific and complex cultural characteristics because they have comprehensive cultural dimensions, both dimensions that can be read from the outside and dimensions of mystery that is difficult to understand. To get to know the Balinese people and their culture, one must understand their feelings, thoughts, and conscience in the system of a unified culture. The behavior of individual Balinese people has a very close relationship with the cultural system, the customs of the community in which Hindu religious values are contained, which become their life guidelines (Mandra, 2023; Suwadnyana et al., 2023). The island of Bali is also a foreign and domestic tourism destination in Indonesia; even foreign guests ask; which side of Indonesia is the island of Bali? The question is undoubtedly very ironic because Bali is one of the small islands of thousands of islands in Indonesia. That is, the island of Bali is the territory of Indonesia. With so many tourist visits to Bali, many decide to migrate/remain in Bali. The logical consequence is that the demographic aspect of the Balinese population is multi-ethnic; there are Javanese, Sasak, Bugis, Malay, Flores, Batak, and so on. Uniquely, these ethnic groups live in remote pockets of the island of Bali; for example, ethnic Bugis in Serangan, South Denpasar, which incidentally is Muslim, Javanese village in Denpasar, Kepaon ethnic Islam in Denpasar, Bugis village in Buleleng, Javanese village in Buleleng, Islamic ethnic Pegayaman in Buleleng, Islamic ethnicity in Buitan village in Manggis- Karangasem, and many pockets of the Balinese who claim to be their origins.

3.2.1. Historical factors (history)

According to historical records of Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali, such as in Buitan Village, Manggis, Karangasem, they have existed since the royal era, namely; Since the King of Karangasem, I Gusti Anglurah Ktut Karangasem ruled (around the XVII century), he has placed Muslim residents in Buitan Village, Manggis, Karangasem as part of a strategy to protect and defend the kingdom from other royal attacks, both from within and from outside Bali.

Apart from being a strategy to protect the kingdom, Muslims also served as cultivators of the land and loyal servants of the King of Karangasem. At that time, the King of Karangasem also provided a "yard" (a place to live), rice fields, and gardens as a source of life for Muslims, for example, *nyama*/brothers of Islam Budakeling, Sidemen, and Buitan in Karangasem. What's more unique is that their residences with Hindus are arranged alternately between "Islamic villages" and "Hindu Pakraman Villages," which allow Hindu-Islamic relations to continue to be well established until now. Since then, the philosophy of "*Tat Twam Asi*," Hindu- Islamic ties have been well documented and harmonious. The principles of religious tolerance, Hindu-Islam, have been well-rooted since the time of the Balinese kingdom (Busro & Gateri, 2023; Gorda, 2004).

Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali can also be found in almost all regencies/cities in Bali, for example; in Jembrana Regency, there are Loloan Barat and Loloan Timur Villages or Yeh Kuning Villages with Yellow Water, in Buleleng, there are Pegayaman Villages, Bugis Villages, Java Villages, in Denpasar Municipality there are Suung Villages, Kepaon, and Bugis Villages in Serangan Village, Klungkung Regency there are Banjar Bees, and so on. In the village area, Hindus and Muslims live in harmony and peace. This means that their religion, culture, and ethnic origins do not become obstacles to harmonious relations in Bali. Likewise, Haji Ridwan's testimony in responding to Hindu-Islamic concerns in the Sinduwati Village Nurasa (2007) said that the establishment of a mosque in Sindu Village, Karangasem was an indication from the Griya Sindu elder who

understood the establishment of a holy place/mosque, he said the mosque should be placed north of Kampung Sindu. Muslims built a mosque to the north of Sindu Village after being instructed and blessed by a brahmin from Griya Sindu. Likewise, religious tolerance between Hindu-Muslims in Sindu is well maintained because of the mutual respect and assistance between Hindus and Muslims in Sindu Village.

Haji Sabri, one of the Islamic leaders in Sindu Village, said that if Hindus carry out a yadnya ceremony at the temple, Muslims participate in the “*punia/fund*,” giving donations in the form of money collectively according to their respective abilities. Likewise, celebrations of holidays, both Hindu holidays and Muslim holidays such as the month of Fasting, Eid al-Fitr, and so on, can run safely and in an orderly manner; these two communities of different religions can celebrate their respective holidays with solemn and solemn (Nurasa, 2007). So, the implementation of religious teachings can be carried out well between the two Hindu-Islamic communities in Manggis District, which is based on an attitude of tolerance and the spirit of “*menyama braya*” between the two communities. The existence of good communication, mutual understanding, mutual respect-respect, mutual help, and inclusiveness/openness to other communities can be a motivation to live safely and comfortably in a particular area called “community.”

3.2.2. Cultural factors (culture)

Culture plays a vital role in supporting the creation of Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali. Concepts related to socio-cultural dynamics and processes, such as; socialization, enculturation, evolution, assimilation, and acculturation, are models of cross-cultural renewal that give birth to a culture of pluralism (Bilo & Hutahaean, 2023; Linggih & Sudarsana, 2020). First; Socialization, the process experienced by a person or group of people throughout their lives through intense communication, getting to know each other, adjusting to individuals and society, is a way to live in harmony and harmony among themselves. Second, enculturation is an adaptation process carried out by a person gradually by studying the customs, norms, habits, and culture that apply to the lives of residents. Third, evolution slowly changes society and culture to other individuals from one community to another, allowing cultural change, both the culture that comes and is visited. Fourth, assimilation is the process of cultural renewal from different ethnic cultures due to the direct and intensive association of individuals or community groups for a long time. The renewal process resulted in each culture- changing, adapting to each other into one. Fifth, acculturation is the process of adapting elements of foreign culture to local culture so that aspects of foreign culture are gradually accepted and processed into local culture without causing the loss of the personality of the receiving culture (Astuti Dewi, 2012; Sarjana & Anshori, 2023).

Examining the cross-cultural Hindu-Islamic interaction that occurred in Manggis Village, it seems that there has been a process of socialization, enculturation, and cultural acculturation between the two communities. Such behavior is evident in culture, exemplifying each other, marriages between Hindus and Muslims, the use of Balinese in daily interactions, and so on. The culture of “taking care of each other” (visiting each other) is carried out when residents, whether Hindus or Muslims, perform wedding ceremonies, experience death, funerals, or other religious ceremonies. The tradition of interfaith marriages also occurs in Manggis Village, Karangasem. So far, there have been no problems with inter-religious marriages. Local practice “enforces” (though not always) the wife follows the husband’s religion. Weddings like this strengthen kinship between religious people, especially Hindu-Muslims in Manggis Village (Astuti Dewi, 2012).

In the interaction between Hindus and Muslims, they often use Balinese as their daily social language. Muslims use the Balinese language as an element of Balinese culture to communicate in everyday interactions, both among Muslims and with Hindus in the village. The use of the Balinese language can also strengthen Hindu- Islamic relations in the area.

3.2.3. *Economic factors.* Based on the data in the monograph of Mangosteen Village in 2011, the majority (75%) of the population of Manggis Village work in the agricultural sector and 25% in other sectors, such as; as teachers/PNS, ABRI, POLRI, and so on. The daily activities of Hindus in Manggis Village depend on their lives as farmers and fishers, while the Muslims rely on them as traders and anglers. According to Muchsin (in Astuti Dewi, 2012, p. 118), the fishermen in Buitan Village have an organization called “Bahari,” namely a fishing organization based in Pengalon Village, and its members consist of 20 fishermen who are Muslim and the rest are Hindus. The organization is a vehicle for interaction between fellow Hindu and Muslim fishers. So, in the anglers’ organization, there is also a good relationship between the two religious’ communities.

The existence of subak supports the agricultural sector in the village. Subak is a typical Balinese organization that regulates irrigation/irrigation for rice fields. In Manggis Village there are two types of subak, namely; subak abian and subak carik. In the past, both Muslim and Hindu farmers were members of the subak, but after the tourism sector developed in Bali, especially in Manggis Village, part of the agricultural land was converted and contracted out to investors to build bungalows, hotels, and restaurants (Astuti Dewi, 2012).

3.2.4. *Political factors.* The existence of Muslims in Manggis Village cannot be separated from the history of the Karangasem Kingdom. In the Pabancangah manuscript, Dane Poleng (Korn Collette) records that King I Gusti Ketut Karangasem sent troops under Dane Poleng to attack Datu Meraja Seleparang. In Sasak, he was greeted by Datu Pejanggih. The attack occurred in 1691 AD, with the victory on the side of the King of Karangasem.

The victory over King Pejanggih in Lombok had consequences for the arrival of Sasak people who were Muslim to Karangasem as the King’s accompaniment. The King of Karangasem then placed the Sasak Muslim residents alternately with Hindus around the Karangasem Royal Palace. The Muslim residents were given land for agricultural cultivation and landed for worship places by the King. The placement of Muslims like that has a political purpose, namely as a fortress to protect the Karangasem Kingdom from enemy attacks that come from outside. So it is understandable Muslim settlements are located around the Karangasem Royal Palace, starting from the south, east, and west scattered among the Hindu settlements of Karangasem residents. In the south, Muslim residents were placed in what is now known as Kampung Ujung Pesisir, Ujung Sumbawa, Ujung Desa, Segara Katon, and Dangin Sema. To the east are Nyuling Village, Tihing Jangkrik, Anyar Village, Sasak Karang, Tibulaka Sasak, Tabuhan Hill, and Ceremen Coral. In the west, there are Bangras Villages, Langko Villages, Karang Toh Pati, Ampel Villages, Grembang, Karang Cane, Sweet Oranges, and Holy Glumpang. Then in the second layer of the west, there are Muslim settlements in Subagan, Karang Sokong, Telaga Mas, Kecicang, Kedokan, Saren Jawa, Sindu Village, and Buitan Village (Agung in Nurasa, 2007).

The existence of Muslim settlements which are placed alternately between the Pakraman villages is also aimed at associating with the Hindu population of Karangasem. This assimilation allows interaction between Hindus and Muslims. The interactions that have lasted hundreds of years have given rise to mutual understanding and mutual respect for differences. Differences in ethnic backgrounds and beliefs do not prevent Hindus and Muslims from coexisting in harmony and peace. Harmony and peace are essential requirements for everyone to carry out their activities calmly, peacefully, and serenely.

Every religious teaching (whatever its name) teaches humanity as God’s creation so that they can live in harmony and peace with each other. In Hinduism and Islam, some teachings emphasize the importance of balance in human life. Without connection, the survival of energy and life can be maintained.

4. Conclusion

The inhabitants of the island of Bali, although diverse and have different beliefs, inter-religious harmony can still be well maintained. Religious peace and harmony in Bali, especially Muslims and Hindus, have been established since the days of the kingdom. This historical fact has an adhesive

value of brotherhood and togetherness between Muslims and Hindus, who make up the majority of the population of Bali. The existence of mutual respect and appreciation between religious adherents is the key to successful harmony and harmonious relations between religious believers in Bali. Minority Muslims respect the majority Hindus, and vice versa; the majority Hindus take care of the minority Muslims. This sense of mutual care and respect is the key to inter-religious harmony in Bali.

Other factors that significantly influence the harmony of Hindu-Islamic relations are: (1) historical factors; namely, in the ancient kingdom, the King of Karangasem named I Gusti Ketut Karangasem, placed Muslim residents in Buitan Village, Manggis District, Karangasem Regency, (2) Cultural factors; namely mutual “medelokan” (visit-visit) between residents of Buitan-Manggis village is still vigorously carried out when residents are carrying out ceremonies, whether marriage ceremonies, experiencing grief (death), *Ngaben* ceremonies, and traditional ceremonies or other religious ceremonies. The “*melokan*” culture is still being carried out today, (3) Economic factors, namely the livelihoods of the residents of Buitan-Manggis village, still rely on the agricultural, fishing, and trading sectors as their primary livelihoods. The residents there have a “Maritime” organization for those who work as fishermen and a “*Subak*” organization for those who work as farmers in the fields and the areas. This organization is a vehicle for the interaction of citizens, both Hindu and Muslim, (4) Political factors; namely, the victory of the Karangasem kingdom in the past with the Sasak kingdom in Lombok brought the consequence of the arrival of the Sasak tribespeople who were diverse in Islam to Karangasem as the King’s order (accompaniment). The King of Karangasem then placed Sasak Muslims to live alternately between Hindu villages and Muslim villages from Sasak. The residence given by the King was also close to the Karangasem kingdom. Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali remain harmonious because they are maintained by the cultural concept of “*menyama braya*,” meaning that Hindus regard Muslims and other people in Bali as not as other people but as brothers. Then came the terms “*nyama selam*” (Muslim brother), “*Christian nyama*” (Christian brother), “*nyama china*” (Chinese brother, both Buddhist and Confucian). The cultural concept of “*menyama braya*” gives rise to mutual respect, respect, and tolerance between religious people.

On the other hand, Muslims in Bali have always adhered to the “*Ukhuwah Islamiyah*” principle, which means Islamic brotherhood or association according to Islam. Meanwhile, another concept held by Muslims in Bali to participate in creating harmony is “*rahmatan lil alamin*” Islam, which develops patterns of human relations that are pluralist, humanist, dialogical and tolerant others. Simply put, Islam “*rahmatan lil alamin*” is Islam as a mercy for the entire universe.

Author details

I Ketut Wisarja¹

E-mail: wisarjaketut@gmail.com

I Ketut Sudarsana¹

¹ Department of Hindu Philosophy, Universitas Hindu Negeri I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Citation information

Cite this article as: Tracking the factors causing harmonious Hindu-Islamic relations in Bali, I Ketut Wisarja & I Ketut Sudarsana, *Cogent Social Sciences* (2023), 9: 2259470.

References

Abdillah, M. (2015). *Islam & Dinamika Sosial Politik di Indonesia*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Adhitama, S. (2023). Analisis Keharmonisan Antara Agama Hindu Dan Buddha Pada Candi Jawa. *Jurnal Penelitian Agama Hindu*, 7(3), 330–345. <https://doi.org/10.37329/jpah.v7i3.2461>

Ardhana, I. K., Soenaryo, F. X., Sulandari, E., & Suwitha, I. P. G. (2011). *Sosial Masyarakat Multikultural Bali: Tinjauan Sejarah, Migrasi, dan Integrasi*. Pustaka Larasan.

Astuti Dewi, N. N. (2012). *Interaksi Umat Hindu dengan Umat Islam di Desa Manggis (Perspektif Pendidikan Multikultur)*. IHDN Denpasar.

Bertens, K. (1999). *Filsafat Barat Kontemporer Prancis*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Bertens, K. (2002). *Filsafat Barat Kontemporer Inggris-Jerman*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Bilo, D. T., & Hutahaean, H. (2023). Implementasi Pemahaman Teologi Pernikahan Umat Hindu dan Kristen Di Pintubesi Bagi Kerukunan. *Jurnal Penelitian Agama Hindu*, 7(2), 121–134. <https://doi.org/10.37329/jpah.v7i2.2041>

Busro, B., & Gateri, N. W. (2023). Building tolerance through Hindu religious textbooks: Teaching tolerance values to Elementary School students through stories and illustrations. *Jurnal Penelitian Agama Hindu*, 7(3), 317–329. <https://doi.org/10.37329/jpah.v7i3.2433>

Davidson, N., & Waghid, Y. (2016). *Ethical dimensions of Muslim education*. Springer International Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-29317-2>

- Eka, I. W. (2023). The religiosity of the wali topeng dhakarya in the religious life of Hindus in Bali. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Sciences*, 1(1), 16–29. <https://doi.org/10.37329/ijms.v1i1.2301>
- Gandhi, M. (1996). *The collected works of Mahatma Gandhi* 34. Publication Division.
- Gorda, I. G. N. (1996). *Etika Hindu dan Perilaku Organisasi*. Widya Kriya Gematama.
- Gorda, I. G. N. (2004). *Biografi Singkat Anak Agung Bagus Ngurah Agung*. Astabrata.
- Hamali, M. H. (2015). *The middle path of moderation in Islam: The Qur'anic principle of wasatiyyah*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780190226831.003.0017>
- Kementerian Agama, R. I. (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI.
- Nggih, I. N., & Sudarsana, I. K. (2020). The dynamics of rejang renteng dance in bali as an intangible cultural heritage of the world. *Space and Culture, India*, 7(4), 45–58. <https://doi.org/10.20896/saci.v7i4.580>
- Mandra, I. W. (2023). The relationship between Hindu religious education learning outcomes and students' affective aspects. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Sciences*, 1(1), 113–124. <https://doi.org/10.37329/ijms.v1i1.2387>
- Muhajir, A. (2018). Penanaman Karakter Moderat di Ma'had Aly Situbondo. *Jurnal Edukasi Kemenag*, 15(3), 459–470. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v15i3.456>
- Nurasa, I. W. (2007). *Interaksi Umat Hindu dan Islam dalam Kehidupan Masyarakat Desa Sinduwati (Perspektif Tri Hita Karana)*. Program Pascasarjana Institut Hindu Dharma Negeri Denpasar.
- Qaradāwī, Y. (2010). *Islamic awakening between rejection and extremism*. The Other Press.
- Sarjana, I. P., & Anshori, Y. (2023). Social interaction patterns of Muslim-Hindu in Kampung Loloan Jembrana: A sociological-historical review. *Jurnal Penelitian Agama Hindu*, 7(3), 371–382. <https://doi.org/10.37329/jpah.v7i3.2499>
- Sudarsana, I. K., Marsono, S. G. D. D., & Mastini, G. N. (2023). The impact of post-online learning gadget usage on students' Hinduism learning behavior and learning outcome. *European Chemical Bulletin*, 12(5), 5094–5109. <https://doi.org/10.31838/ecb/2023.12.5.396>
- Suwadnyana, I. W., Wastawa, I. W., & Sudarsana, I. K. (2023). The myth of Yeh Haa: Mapag Toya Tradition Communication system in water conservation. *Jurnal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture*, 34, 2729–2746. <https://doi.org/10.59670/jns.v34i.1619>
- Van der, W. (2000). *Filsuf-Filsuf Besar Tentang Manusia*. Terjemahan K. Bertens. Eds. Kanisius.
- Wahyudi, C. (2011). Tipologi Islam Moderat dan Puritan. *Pemikiran Khaled M Abou el- Fadl*, 1(1), 75–92.
- Wahyudi, C. (2011). OSOFI: Jurnal Tasawuf dan Pemikiran Islam. <https://doi.org/10.15642/teosofi.2011.1.1.75-92>
- Wirata, I. W. (2023). Kohesifitas Sosial Harmoni Umat Beragama Pada Masyarakat Lombok (Pendekatan Sosiologi Agama): (Pendekatan Sosiologi Agama). *Jurnal Penelitian Agama Hindu*, 7(3), 267–274. <https://doi.org/10.37329/jpah.v7i3.2424>
- Wisarja, I. K. (2017). *Humanitas Agama Hindu Pada Shram Ratu Bagus di Desa Muncan Kecamatan Selat Kabupaten Karangasem*. IHDN Denpasar.

● **12% Overall Similarity**

Top sources found in the following databases:

- Crossref Posted Content database
- 12% Submitted Works database

TOP SOURCES

The sources with the highest number of matches within the submission. Overlapping sources will not be displayed.

1	Universitas Brawijaya on 2023-05-12 Submitted works	3%
2	Hadassah Academic College on 2022-11-03 Submitted works	1%
3	Universitas Brawijaya on 2023-09-29 Submitted works	<1%
4	Universitas Mahasaraswati Denpasar on 2023-06-25 Submitted works	<1%
5	IAIN Metro Lampung on 2022-10-05 Submitted works	<1%
6	California State University, Fresno on 2023-03-15 Submitted works	<1%
7	UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta on 2022-01-29 Submitted works	<1%
8	University of South Florida on 2022-12-06 Submitted works	<1%
9	Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta on 2022-03-29 Submitted works	<1%

10	Universitas Negeri Jakarta on 2021-01-04 Submitted works	<1%
11	State Islamic University of Alauddin Makassar on 2022-02-13 Submitted works	<1%
12	UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta on 2020-06-25 Submitted works	<1%
13	Universitas Islam Internasional Indonesi on 2022-01-25 Submitted works	<1%
14	University of Queensland on 2023-05-11 Submitted works	<1%
15	Universitas Brawijaya on 2023-03-14 Submitted works	<1%
16	Universitas Sebelas Maret on 2021-12-29 Submitted works	<1%
17	itera on 2022-12-29 Submitted works	<1%
18	Defense University on 2023-03-25 Submitted works	<1%
19	Sriwijaya University on 2019-03-21 Submitted works	<1%
20	Houston Community College on 2023-07-24 Submitted works	<1%
21	Lambung Mangkurat University on 2019-09-19 Submitted works	<1%

22	Adtalem Global Education on 2023-08-01 Submitted works	<1%
23	Universitas Negeri Manado on 2021-03-08 Submitted works	<1%
24	University of the Western Cape on 2017-02-23 Submitted works	<1%
25	UIN Sultan Maulana Hasanudin on 2020-01-28 Submitted works	<1%
26	University of Edinburgh on 2022-08-12 Submitted works	<1%
27	The University of Manchester on 2022-04-19 Submitted works	<1%
28	Udayana University on 2018-02-07 Submitted works	<1%
29	Udayana University on 2020-02-04 Submitted works	<1%
30	Politeknik Pariwisata Bali on 2020-10-06 Submitted works	<1%
31	Udayana University on 2015-04-17 Submitted works	<1%
32	Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara on 2023-08-02 Submitted works	<1%
33	University of Teesside on 2022-01-12 Submitted works	<1%

● Excluded from Similarity Report

- Internet database
- Crossref database
- Publications database
- Manually excluded sources

EXCLUDED SOURCES

American University in the Emirates on 2023-04-30

4%

Submitted works